# Recommendation to Reopen Chicago Police Department Disciplinary Investigation

CPD Log #2023-0004720
OIG Case #C2025-000000082
Published October 17, 2025

DEBORAH WITZBURG | INSPECTOR GENERAL FOR THE CITY OF CHICAGO TOBARA RICHARDSON | DEPUTY INSPECTOR GENERAL FOR PUBLIC SAFETY

### October 17, 2025

Pursuant to the Municipal Code of Chicago (MCC) § 2-56-230(c)(ii), the Public Safety section of the City of Chicago Office of Inspector General (OIG) conducts reviews of individual closed disciplinary investigations conducted by the Civilian Office of Police Accountability (COPA) and the Chicago Police Department's (CPD) Bureau of Internal Affairs (BIA). Based on those reviews, OIG may make a recommendation to reopen the investigation to address a deficiency materially affecting its outcome.<sup>1</sup>

COPA investigated allegations stemming from a traffic stop during which CPD members Tyler Alexander, Star #17587, Dexter Calhoun, Star #17364, Thomas Spanos, Star #3110, Patrick Aziz, Star #16188, allegedly stopped, detained, and handcuffed the complainant without justification, among other allegations, and Officer Spanos directed the use of verbal abuse at the complainant. COPA also investigated a complaint that Detention Aide (DA) Andrew McGuire, Employee #109719, held the complainant down on the floor by the back of their neck. COPA sustained the allegations against Officer Spanos for verbal abuse and sustained the allegation that DA McGuire held the complainant down by the back of their neck. COPA recommended a three-day suspension for Officer Spanos and a 30-day suspension for DA McGuire.

During its review, OIG identified that Officer Alexander potentially performed an unlawful search of the complainant's person, in violation of the Fourth Amendment of the United States Constitution. Additionally, OIG identified video evidence that was material to the lawfulness of the traffic stop, and that Officers Alexander and Calhoun's statements may conflict with video evidence potentially violating CPD's Rules of Conduct, specifically Rule 14.

OIG recommended that COPA reopen the investigation to conduct an analysis of whether Officer Alexander's search of the complainant's person was justified, whether the video evidence refutes Officers Alexander and Calhoun's reason for the traffic stop, and whether they violated Rule 14 during their interviews with COPA.

In response to OIG's recommendations, COPA declined to reopen the investigation. COPA stated that the video evidence does not satisfy the burden that Officers Alexander and Calhoun willfully made a false statement, and that serving allegations against Officer Alexander for an incident that occurred over 18 months ago is unlikely to result in sustained discipline.

OIG's letter to COPA containing its recommendations is attached in Appendix A. COPA's response is attached as Appendix B.

¹ Once BIA or COPA has responded to an OIG recommendation to reopen an investigation, and once the underlying investigation has reached a final disciplinary decision, OIG's recommendation letters and the agencies' responses will be published on OIG's website. In these procedural postures, OIG's recommendations to reopen and the agencies' responses have been available and, from time to time, released pursuant to MCC § 2-56-250 and the Illinois Freedom of Information Act. These recommendations to reopen, issued pursuant to MCC § 2-56-230(c), are separate from OIG's own confidential investigative work, which is governed by the confidentiality provisions set out in MCC § 2-56-110.

# Appendix A | OIG Letter



Deborah Witzburg | Inspector General City of Chicago Office of Inspector General 231 South LaSalle Street, 12<sup>th</sup> Floor Chicago, IL 60604 Phone: (773) 478-7799

### Via Electronic Mail

March 5, 2025

ROBIN MURPHY GENERAL COUNSEL CIVILIAN OFFICE OF POLICE ACCOUNTABILITY 1615 WEST CHICAGO AVENUE, 4TH FLOOR CHICAGO, ILLINOIS 60622

Re: Log #2023-0004720

Dear General Counsel Murphy:

Pursuant to § 2-56-230(c)(ii) of the Municipal Code of Chicago (MCC), the Office of Inspector General's (OIG) Public Safety section has conducted a preliminary review of the investigation conducted by the Civilian Office of Police Accountability (COPA) in Log #2023-0004720. OIG recommends that the investigation be reopened to address all evidence and potential allegations. Log #2023-0004720 is currently in a command channel review status.

Log #2023-0004720 concerns allegations that: CPD Officer Tyler Alexander, Star #17587, stopped, detained, and handcuffed the complainant without justification, and searched the complainant's vehicle without justification; Officer Dexter Calhoun, Star #17364, stopped, detained, and handcuffed the complainant without justification, and failed to activate their Body Worn Camera (BWC) in a timely manner; Officer Thomas Spanos, Star #3110, stopped, detained, and handcuffed the complainant without justification, and directed the use of verbal abuse by using profanity toward the complainant; Officer Patrick Aziz, Star #16188, stopped, detained, and handcuffed the complainant without justification, and Detention Aide Andrew McGuire, Employee #109719, held the complainant down on the floor by the back of their neck, and failed to complete a Tactical Response Report (TRR).¹ COPA sustained the allegation of verbal abuse against Officer Spanos, and sustained the allegation that Detention Aide McGuire held the complainant down by the back of their neck.² All other allegations made against the accused officers were exonerated or not sustained. COPA recommended up to 30 days suspension for Officer Spanos and Detention Aide McGuire.

According to the Arrest Report, on October 5, 2023, Officers Alexander and Calhoun conducted a traffic stop on a silver Mercedes for failure to use a turn signal when turning into a gas station.<sup>3</sup> "After [the complainant] entered the gas station, he immediately exited the vehicle, locked his

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Attachment 94.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Attachment 2.

doors, and walked towards the gas station's entrance." Officer Alexander stopped the complainant and explained that they were being detained, and that it was a valid traffic stop.

During the interaction between Officer Alexander and the complainant, Officer Alexander's BWC shows the complainant holding a set of keys in their left hand while simultaneously raising both hands in the air and stating "you not 'finna' take my keys, bro." Officer Alexander's BWC shows the complainant reach down toward their front waist band and place the keys in their front left pants pocket. On Officer Spanos BWC, at the 3:05 mark, it captures Officer Alexander reaching into the complainant's pockets with an empty hand and retrieve the complainant's car keys.

Officer Alexander approaches the silver Mercedes and looks inside the vehicle through the front windshield. According to the Arrest Report, Officer Alexander observed a "clear plastic cup containing an amber colored liquid, suspect alcohol, in the center cupholder and a clear glass bottle of D'Usse in the rear passenger seat." On Officer Alexander's BWC footage, Officer Alexander opens the front driver's door to the Mercedes, causing the vehicle's alarm to sound, thus prompting Officer Alexander to manipulate the key fob to turn off the vehicle's alarm. Officer Alexander's BWC shows them performing a search of the vehicle which resulted in the discovery of a firearm.

After Officer Alexander discovers the firearm, the accused CPD officers attempt to place the complainant in handcuffs. The complainant resists handcuffing efforts and the accused CPD officers conduct an emergency takedown of the complainant. The accused CPD Officers eventually handcuff the complainant and transport them to the 11<sup>th</sup> District Police Station for processing.

On the Investigatory Stop Report (ISR), Offer Alexander responds, "Yes" to the question, "Was a search beyond a protective pat down conducted of the person?" However, Officer Alexander, in the narrative portion of the ISR, does not provide an explanation for the search of the complainant's person or documents that the complainant's car keys were recovered from the search.<sup>12</sup>

COPA interviewed Officer Alexander and asked them if they performed a search of the complainant. Officer Alexander stated, "Yes" followed by "It would've been – oh, me personally, it would've been a custodial search. I actually don't think I performed that. It would've been performed inside the 11<sup>th</sup> District because it sounds like he got taken straight to our lockup." COPA did not conduct an analysis of whether Officer Alexander's reaching inside of the complainant's pocket to retrieve their car keys without the complainant's permission constituted an unjustified search.

Additionally, Officer Alexander attested in the Arrest Report, that "while on routine patrol AO's observed a silver Mercedes sedan turn into the Falcon Fuel gas station located at 43 N. Homan

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Attachment 94.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Attachment 7 at 2:50 mark.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Ibid at 2:57 mark.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Attachment 4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Attachment 7 at 3:20 mark.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Attachment 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Attachment 7 at 3:30 mark.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Ibid at 3:35 mark.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Attachment 50.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Attachment 83, pg. 13, lns. 7-14.

without using it's [sic] turn signal."<sup>14</sup> However, OIG's review of the gas station's security camera footage<sup>15</sup> shows the silver Mercedes turning into the gas station with an amber colored light flashing on the driver's side-view mirror indicating the complainant did have the vehicle's turn signal activated.<sup>16</sup>

In Officer Alexander's interview with COPA, they state, "I remember traveling northbound on Homan. As we were approaching the gas station, I observed a silver Mercedes sedan. It quickly turned into the gas station without using its turn signal." According to the gas station security video, Officer Alexander entered the gas station traveling in the opposite direction of the complainant when Officer Alexander enters the gas station lot and positions his vehicle in front of the complainant's vehicle that was stopped at a gas pump. COPA asks Officer Alexander, "Can you tell me the specific reasons you and your partner stopped him?" and Officer Alexander responds by stating "Failure to use a turn signal." 18

COPA interviewed Officer Calhoun, and asked "Can you tell me the reasons or the reasons why your partner stopped him?" Officer Calhoun responded, "As I stated before, it was a traffic violation. He didn't turn – use his turn signal, and then we ran his plates and the plate didn't come back to the vehicle." <sup>19</sup>

COPA did not conduct an analysis regarding whether Officer Alexander's reaching into the complainant's pocket may constitute an unlawful search. COPA's analysis also failed to consider video evidence that shows a blinking amber light on the driver's side mirror as the complainant makes the turn into the gas station and whether this evidence refutes Officers Alexander and Calhoun's claim that the complainant failed to use a turn signal.

Based on OIG's preliminary review, and without taking any position on any other aspect of the investigation or its findings, OIG recommends that COPA reopen Log #2023-0004720 to complete a Fourth Amendment analysis of whether Officer Alexander reaching into the complainant's pocket constitutes an unlawful search. OIG also recommends that COPA consider the video evidence material to the lawfulness of the traffic stop and conduct a Rule 14 analysis regarding Officers Alexander and Calhoun's statements that the complainant failed to use a turn signal, and determine if their actions violate applicable Department orders and directives.

Please contact Chief Investigative Analyst LaDonna Candia-Flanagan at lcandia-flanagan@igchicago.org or (773) 478-5614 with any questions. Please send your response to this recommendation within the time allowed by MCC § 2-56-245. OIG will consider a failure to respond in the time permitted by ordinance to be a declination of our recommendation. OIG looks forward to COPA's response, and recommends that COPA incorporate this letter and its response into the electronic case file to provide for a complete record.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Attachment 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Attachment 27 at 13:18-13:21 mark.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> The Original Case Incident Report lists the complainant's vehicle as a "2004 Mercedes-Benz E-320Sedan." According to the Mercedes-Benz E-Class Sedan Operator's Manual, , this is a feature of the E-320-Series Sedan; p.365, accessed February 27, 2025, https://www.manua.ls/mercedes/e-class-2004/manual?p=366.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Attachment 83, pg. 7, lns. 19-23.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Attachment 83, pg. 10, lns. 3-5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Attachment 80, pgs. 8-9, Ins. 23-24, 1-4.

Respectfully,

Tobara Richardson

Deputy Inspector General for Public Safety Office of Inspector General

cc: Deborah Witzburg, Inspector General, OIG Samuel Chae, Associate General Counsel for Public Safety, OIG LaDonna Candia-Flanagan, Chief Investigative Analyst for Public Safety, OIG Angela Snell, Chief Investigative Law Officer, COPA Yolanda Talley, Chief, Bureau of Internal Affairs, CPD

# Appendix B | Department Response



May 30, 2025

Tobara Richardson Deputy Inspector General for Public Safety Office of Inspector General 740 North Sedgwick Street, Suite 200 Chicago, Illinois 60654

Via Electronic Mail

Re: Re-Open Recommendation Log No. 2023-0004720

Dear Deputy Inspector General Richardson:

I am in receipt of your March 25, 2024, letter recommending that COPA re-open and conduct additional investigation in Log No. 2023-0004720. We understand the Office of the Inspector General - Deputy Inspector General for Public Safety (PSIG) recommends re-opening this case to address all evidence and potential allegations. For the reasons stated below, COPA does not concur with PSIG's recommendation to re-open.

PSIG asks that COPA reopen this log to consider whether Police Officer Tyler Alexander<sup>1</sup> falsely reported that the complainant did not use a turn signal in violation of CPD Rule 14. Proof of a Rule 14 violation requires three elements: that a false statement was made, that it was made willfully, and that it was made about a fact that was material to the incident under investigation.<sup>2</sup> COPA does not believe the evidence satisfies the heavy burden to show Officer Alexander's statements were willfully made. The video evidence PSIG identified does not prove Officer Alexander in fact observed the flashing signal on the sideview mirror of the complainant's car.<sup>3</sup>

PSIG also asks that COPA reopen this log to consider whether Officer Alexander unlawfully searched the complainant's pocket. Reopening this case now to serve an allegation against Officer Alexander on this basis is unlikely to result in sustained discipline because the incident occurred over 18 months ago.<sup>4</sup>

[Remainder of page left intentionally blank]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Star # 17587.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> See Agreement Between the City of Chicago Department of Police and the Fraternal Order of Police Chicago Lodge No. 7 §6.1(M).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> There is also no evidence to establish if the headlight signal was properly functioning.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> See Agreement Between the City of Chicago Department of Police and the Fraternal Order of Police Chicago Lodge No. 7 §8.10.

Page 2 of 2 May 30, 2025 Deputy Inspector General Tobara Richardson

Under COPA's ordinance, the Chief Administrator may, in their discretion, re-open any closed investigation upon PSIG's recommendation.<sup>5</sup> Here, I cannot find an appropriate basis to re-open this investigation. I appreciate your continued diligent and careful review of closed COPA investigations.

Respectfully,

LaKenya White

Interim Chief Administrator

Civilian Office of Police Accountability

La Kenyo Le

cc: Deborah Witzburg (OIG)

LaDonna Candia-Flanagan (OIG)

Samuel Chae (OIG) Yolanda Talley (CPD)

Timothy Moore (CPD)

Angie Snell (COPA)

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> MCC § 2-78-120(x)(iii).



## LaDonna Candia-Flanagan

Chief Investigative Analyst for Public Safety

The City of Chicago Office of Inspector General is an independent, nonpartisan oversight agency whose mission is to promote economy, efficiency, effectiveness, and integrity in the administration of programs and operations of City government.

OIG's authority to produce reports of its findings and recommendations is established in the City of Chicago Municipal Code §§ 2-56-030(d), -035(c), -110, -230, and -240.

For further information about this report, please contact the City of Chicago Office of Inspector General, 231 S. LaSalle Street, 12th Floor, Chicago, Illinois 60604 or visit our website at igchicago.org.

Talk to Us (833) TALK-2-IG/(833) 825-5244 talk2ig@igchicago.org Igchicago.org/talk2ig

**OIG Business Office** (773) 478-7799

Cover photo courtesy of the Department of Assets, Information and Services. Alternate formats available upon request.









