



CITY OF CHICAGO
OFFICE OF INSPECTOR GENERAL

20
23

COMPLIANCE SECTION

2022 Annual Report

JULY 31, 2023

DEBORAH WITZBURG | INSPECTOR GENERAL FOR THE CITY OF CHICAGO

Table of Contents

I Introduction	2
II Reporting on Monitoring of Employment Actions	3
A Compliance Escalations Received in 2022	3
III Summaries of Escalations	5

I | Introduction

The Office of Inspector General (OIG)'s Compliance section, situated within its Legal section, has broad oversight responsibilities under the Employment and Hiring Plans which govern the employment practices of the City, the Chicago Police Department, and the Chicago Fire Department. The Compliance section came into formal existence as a product of an evolving partnership between OIG and the court-appointed monitor overseeing the City's hiring and promotion practices under the decree entered in *Shakman, et al. v. City of Chicago, et al.*, No. 69-cv-2145 (N.D. Ill.). From spring 2010 through spring 2014, the OIG-*Shakman* monitor partnership gradually transitioned from the court-appointed monitor to OIG for administrative disciplinary investigations, program compliance, and monitoring activities. That transition was completed in June 2014 with the court's finding the City in substantial compliance with the *Shakman* decree.

The Compliance section's responsibilities are specific to monitoring the City's employment actions and include issuing guidance, training, and program recommendations to City departments on a broad and complex array of employment-related actions; monitoring human resources activities including hiring and promotion; performing legally-mandated and discretionary audits; and reviewing the City's hiring and employment practices to ensure compliance with applicable rules.

A strong and effective compliance and governance system is critical to the success of the City of Chicago's Employment Plan. OIG reviews, monitors, and audits key processes in the Employment Plan and receives complaints regarding the hiring process, including escalations. Escalations, as defined by the City of Chicago Employment Plan, occur when a Department of Human Resources (DHR) recruiter suspends a hiring requisition at any point when they have reason to believe that a hiring manager, hiring authority, or other City employee may have committed a violation of the Employment Plan or may have allowed political reasons or factors or other improper considerations to influence the hiring process.

Pursuant to Municipal Code of Chicago § 2-56-035(c), the annual report of OIG's Compliance section provides statistics on the number of escalations newly initiated, pending, closed with investigation, and closed without investigation. The annual report of OIG's Compliance section also provides a description of the outcomes, findings, recommendations, and actions taken on the recommendations of any investigation of an escalation. The Compliance section works to improve the fairness, accountability, and transparency of the City's employment actions.

II | Reporting on Monitoring of Employment Actions

OIG's Compliance section monitors human resources activities, including recruiting, hiring, and promotion, performs legally mandated and discretionary audits, and reviews the City's employment practices to ensure compliance with the various applicable employment plans. By ordinance, the Compliance section's mandate includes the authority to review or investigate allegations of non-compliance with the City of Chicago Employment Plan and related policies and procedures.

A | Compliance Escalations Received in 2022

Escalations, as defined by the City of Chicago Employment Plan occur when a DHR recruiter suspends a hiring requisition at any point when they have reason to believe that a hiring manager, hiring authority, or other City employee may have committed a violation of the Employment Plan or may have allowed political reasons or factors or other improper considerations to influence the hiring process. After receiving notification from the recruiter, OIG evaluates the circumstances surrounding the escalation and may do one or more of the following: conduct a review of the hiring sequence, refer the matter to the DHR commissioner or appropriate department head for resolution, and/or refer the matter to the Investigations section of OIG for investigations of misconduct by a City actor.

In 2022, the Compliance section received eight escalations as indicated below.

Figure 1: 2022 Escalations

Escalation Status	Number of Escalations
Newly Initiated	8
Pending	0
Closed with Investigation	8
Closed without Investigation	0

In reviewing the eight escalations, OIG found that six constituted violations of the City of Chicago Employment Plan and two constituted violations of internal departmental protocols.

Figure 2: Type of Violation

Date Received	Position Title	Department	Violation
9/12/2022	Manager of Building Services	Office of Public Safety Administration	Violation of Employment Plan
9/16/2022	Director of Human Rights Compliance (Fair Housing)	Chicago Commission on Human Relations	Violation of Employment Plan

10/13/2022	Student Intern	City Treasurer's Office	Violation of Employment Plan
10/14/2022	Electrical Inspector I	Department of Buildings	Violation of Departmental Protocols
10/14/2022	Payroll Administrator	Department of Finance	Violation of Employment Plan
10/20/2022	Clerk IV-Timekeeper	Chicago Department of Aviation	Violation of Departmental Protocols
11/8/2022	Director of Human Rights Compliance (Employment)	Chicago Commission on Human Relations	Violation of Employment Plan
12/2/2022	Assistant Corporation Counsel II	Department of Law	Violation of Employment Plan

III | Summaries of Escalations

All escalations have been resolved and each summary is provided below.

1. Office of Public Safety Administration (OPSA), Manager of Building Services

On September 12, 2022, OIG received notice from a DHR recruiter regarding a violation of departmental policy. The DHR recruiter received a memo from the hiring department, OPSA, indicating that it sought to exercise its option to decline to interview an otherwise qualified candidate on a referral list. After receiving the memo, the DHR recruiter was informed that the candidate was interviewed without another interviewer as required by the City of Chicago Employment Plan.

The DHR commissioner worked with the hiring department and explained the standard procedure when exercising the option to decline an otherwise qualified candidate. OIG made no further recommendations.

2. Chicago Commission on Human Relations (CCHR), Director of Human Rights Compliance (Fair Housing)

On September 16, 2022, OIG received notice from a DHR recruiter regarding an employment plan violation in which the hiring department, CCHR, required candidates to submit writing samples without having an approved scoring rubric to score the writing samples.

At the time the escalation was reported, CCHR had interviewed one candidate that submitted a writing sample. The DHR commissioner self-initiated a remedy to provide CCHR with additional training as well as a generic scoring rubric to be used to evaluate the writing sample provided by the interviewed candidate, as well as the future writing samples that would be submitted by other candidates. OIG made no further recommendations.

3. City Treasurer's Office (CTO), Student Intern (2022-000072715)

On October 13, 2022, OIG received notice from a DHR recruiter regarding an employment plan violation in CTO's student intern sequence. The hiring sequence was escalated because CTO deviated from established processes including dividing minimally qualified candidates into groups for interviews, individual interviewers not completing Candidate Assessment Forms for each candidate interviewed, and CTO did not inform OIG of the scheduled interviews at least four days in advance. The DHR commissioner proposed a resolution that included allowing the interview of the first group of candidates to serve as a phone screening so that screened candidates could continue to move forward in the hiring process.

After speaking to all parties involved, the OIG found that the violation occurred when the CTO did not adhere to the processes established with DHR. OIG provided the CTO with a brief training covering the newly revised City of Chicago Employment Plan. Furthermore, OIG recommended to the CTO that Human Resources Liaisons attend DHR-sponsored training to familiarize themselves with the processes required of each City Department.

4. Department of Buildings (DOB), Electrical Inspector I (2022-0000072716)

On October 14, 2022, OIG received notice from the DHR commissioner that the DOB electrical inspector I hiring sequence violated the Employment Plan because a mandatory test was not administered to bidding candidates prior to interviews and subsequent offers of employment to candidates.

OIG found that violations of the Employment Plan occurred in three ways. First, the hiring manager and DHR recruiter did not determine the number of candidates that should have proceeded to the testing phase. Second, the hiring manager and DHR recruiter did not schedule testing for the selected candidates. Third, the hiring manager and DHR did not develop any relevant test material with subject matter experts within DOB.

At the time that OIG was made aware of the escalation, candidate start dates were delayed for OIG review. In consultation with OIG, the DHR commissioner concluded that the hiring sequence would continue with the DOB being advised to follow all hiring protocols in future hiring sequences. OIG concurred with this remedy in light of the candidates being prepared to start working, the likelihood that the candidates could successfully grieve any further changes, and the fact that DOB had intended to eliminate the testing requirement for this position but failed to do so because of an oversight. OIG made no further recommendations.

5. Department of Finance, Payroll Administrator (2022-000072717)

On October 14, 2022, OIG received notice from the DHR commissioner that an escalation occurred during the interview phase of the hiring sequence. A DHR recruiter discovered that pre-approved interview questions were not used during candidates' interviews.

OIG reviewed the hiring sequence and found that it did violate the Employment Plan because the questions used during the interviews were situational and behavioral interview questions – not job-specific as required by the Employment Plan. In further assessing the hiring sequence, OIG found that because the department did not use the pre-approved interview questions, it is unclear whether the non-bidder applicant had demonstrated greater skill and ability required by the representative collective bargaining agreement. OIG recommended that, if the position is later reposted, the department consider the previous senior bidder and place a copy of the submitted memorandum in the hiring file. Pursuant to the Employment Plan, DHR was to respond to OIG's recommendations with any actions taken within 30 days of receipt of the recommendation but has not provided such response.

6. Chicago Department of Aviation (CDA), Clerk IV-Timekeeper (2022-000072719)

On October 20, 2022, OIG received notice from the DHR commissioner that an Employment Plan violation had occurred that entailed internal candidates not completing testing prior to being interviewed for the position of clerk IV-timekeeper with CDA. The violation was discovered by a DHR recruiter during the second round of the hiring sequence for external candidates.

At the time that OIG was made aware of the escalation, a candidate had been offered and accepted the position. Based on this information, the DHR commissioner provided a resolution for the candidate to remain in their position with the second round of the hiring sequence continuing with CDA following all hiring protocols related to testing going forward. OIG concurred with the remedy and made no further recommendations.

7. Chicago Commission on Human Relations (CCHR), Director of Human Rights Compliance (2022-00072877)

On November 8, 2022, OIG received notice from a DHR recruiter regarding an Employment Plan violation in which the hiring department, CCHR, required candidates to submit writing samples without having an approved scoring rubric to score the writing samples.

At the time the escalation was reported, CCHR had interviewed one candidate that submitted a writing sample. DHR commissioner self-initiated a remedy to provide CCHR with a generic scoring rubric to be used to evaluate the writing sample provided by the interviewed candidate as well as the future assessments that would be submitted by other candidates. OIG concurred with the remedy and made no further recommendations.

8. Department of Law (DOL), Assistant Corporation Counsel II (2022-000073432)

On December 2, 2022, OIG received notice from the DOL's director of attorney recruitment and professional development regarding a violation of the DOL hiring process. The violation occurred when the hiring manager did not forward to DHR and OIG the names of candidates and interviewers at least four days before the scheduled interview.

After a preliminary inquiry, OIG found that no political reasons or factors or other improper considerations were considered at any point during the screening, selection, or interview process of the candidate. OIG concurred that the hiring sequence could move forward and made no further recommendations.



Kendra Moore
Compliance Officer

Eloise Markham
Compliance Officer

Wayne Garris
Chief Assistant Inspector General

Nathaniel Wackman
General Counsel

The City of Chicago Office of Inspector General is an independent, nonpartisan oversight agency whose mission is to promote economy, efficiency, effectiveness, and integrity in the administration of programs and operations of city government.

OIG's authority to produce reports of its findings and recommendations is established in the City of Chicago Municipal Code §§ 2-56-030(d), -035(c), -110, -230, and -240.

For further information about this report, please contact the City of Chicago Office of Inspector General, 740 N. Sedgwick St., Suite 200, Chicago, IL 60654, or visit our website at igchicago.org.

Talk to Us
(833) TALK-2-IG/(833) 825-5244
talk2ig@igchicago.org
igchicago.org/talk2ig

OIG Business Office
(773) 478-7799

Cover photo courtesy of the Department of Assets, Information and Services
Alternate formats available upon request.

